

Message Text

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 01 BOMBAY 00552 040422Z

22

ACTION OES-05

INFO OCT-01 NEA-10 ISO-00 NRC-05 AID-05 IO-11 ACDA-05

ERDA-05 OMB-01 TRSE-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-04 H-02

INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05 PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15

USIA-06 /094 W

----- 117243

R 031132Z MAR 76

FM AMCONSUL BOMBAY

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 6215

INFO AMEMBASSY NEW DELHI

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE BOMBAY 0552

EO 11652: NA

TAGS: TECH ENRG IN

SUBJECT: ALLEGED RADIOACTIVITY IN TARAPUR

REF: BOMBAY 505

1. THERE FOLLOWS RECONCILIATION WHICH J.C.SHAH PROMISED BETWEEN HIS STATEMENTS (REPORTED NEW DELHI 1777) AND DR SETHNA'S PRESENTATION (REPORTED BOMBAY'S 505). SHAH STATED EMPHATICALLY THAT THERE IS NO INCONSISTENCY BETWEEN PARA 2(B) AND 2(D) OF BOMBAY'S 505 ON THE ONE HAND, AND HIS STATEMENTS REPORTED IN DELHI'S 1777, AND SHAH SAYS THAT IAEC STANDS BEHIND HIS STATEMENTS AS DEMONSTRATIONS OF THE GOOD HEALTH AND SAFETY PERFORMANCE AT TARAPUR. SHAH SAYS THAT HE PROVIDED DATA IN TERMS OF EFFECT ON PEOPLE AS BEING MORE PERSUASIVE TO THE KIND OF AUDIENCE HE FELT THE SENATE HEARINGS WERE ADDRESSING. HE SAID THAT SETHNA'S DATA, ON OTHER HAND, SIMPLY GIVES DATA TAKEN FROM SAMPLES OF SEAFOOD IN TERMS OF ABSOLUTE CONTENT OF PICO CURIES (PCI/KG) PER KILOGRAM OF IODINE ISOTOPE OF 131 AND ISOTOPE OF CESIUM 134 AND 137 AND OF COBALT 60. SETHNA WANTED DATA CAST IN THIS FORM BECAUSE HE FELT THAT QUERY FROM NRC SCIENTISTS REQUIRED THIS TYPE OF TECHNICAL PRESENTATION.

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

PAGE 02 BOMBAY 00552 040422Z

2. SETHNA'S STATEMENT REGARDING IMPROVEMENT, OR LACK OF IT,

IN FUEL IS DIFFERENT IN EMPHASIS BUT NOT IN SUBSTANCE, SHAH MAINTAINS. SPECIFICALLY, SETHNA SAYS "FUEL PERFORMANCE CANNOT BE SAID TO HAVE IMPROVED SIGNIFICANTLY. THE INITIAL FUEL OBTAINED BEFORE STATION STARTUP HAS PERFORMED POORLY AND THE SUBSEQUENT RELOADS OBTAINED PRIOR TO 1973 HAVE NOT BEEN MUCH BETTER". IN DISCUSSING THIS POINT, SHAH EMPHASIZED THAT SETHNA'S POINT DOES NOT DENY THAT THERE HAS BEEN SOME IMPROVEMENT IN FUEL PERFORMANCE. SHAH SAYS THAT SUCCEEDING BUNDLES OF FUEL ELEMENT WERE BETTER, BUT AS THERE WAS SOME HYDRATION STILL IN THE CORE, THE AMOUNT OF LEAKAGE WAS NOT REDUCED ALL THAT MUCH, SO ONE CANNOT CITE STATISTICS DEMONSTRATING CONCLUSIVELY THAT FUEL PERFORMANCE IS REALLY ON A SUBSTANTIAL UPGRADE. ONE UNSTATED POINT IN BOTH OF THESE PRESENTATIONS, OF COURSE, IS THAT IAEC HAS COLLECTED ON ITS FUEL WARRANTY FROM GE BECAUSE FUEL DID NOT FULLY MEASURE UP TO EXPECTATIONS. IT SEEMS TO ME THAT SETHNA IS SIMPLY BEING EXTREMELY CAUTIOUS TO PRESERVE HIS LEGAL POSITION, VIS A VIS HIS SUPPLIER. ANY OF THE ABOVE STATEMENTS, EXCEPT THOSE REFERRING TO THE WARRANTY PROBLEM AND COLLECTION EFFORTS MADE BY THE INDIAN DEPARTMENT OF ATOMIC ENERGY AGAINST GE, MAY BE USED IN WHATEVER STATEMENTS NRC WISHES TO MAKE TO THE SENATE COMMITTEE ON THIS MATTER. OBVIOUSLY THE US GOVERNMENT CANNOT GET IN-BETWEEN GE AND THE IAEC IN THEIR DISPUTE OVER CONTRACT PERFORMANCE.

3. BOTH SHAH AND SETHNA REMAIN QUITE WILLING TO FURNISH WHATEVER FURTHER CLARIFICATION MAY BE REQUIRED ON THIS MATTER.
COURTNEY

LIMITED OFFICIAL USE

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01 JAN 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: RADIOACTIVE WASTES, NUCLEAR POWER PLANTS, NUCLEAR FUELS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 03 MAR 1976
Decaption Date: 01 JAN 1960
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Authority: saccheem
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 28 MAY 2004
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1976BOMBAY00552
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: N/A
Errors: N/A
Film Number: D760082-0360
From: BOMBAY
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1976/newtext/t197603101/aaaadkzn.tel
Line Count: 89
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Office: ACTION OES
Original Classification: LIMITED OFFICIAL USE
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 2
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: LIMITED OFFICIAL USE
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 76 BOMBAY 505
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Authority: saccheem
Review Comment: n/a
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 22 JUL 2004
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review History: RELEASED <22 JUL 2004 by ullricre>; APPROVED <04 OCT 2004 by saccheem>
Review Markings:

Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
04 MAY 2006

Review Media Identifier:
Review Referrals: n/a
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: ALLEGED RADIOACTIVITY IN TARAPUR
TAGS: TECH, ENRG, IN, (SHAH, J C), (SETHNA, HOMI N)
To: STATE
Type: TE
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 04 MAY 2006